

THE EVALUATION REPORT OF PRINCIPAL RECIPIENT FOR THE GLOBAL FUND ROUND 11
VENUE: CHUNIDING RESORT, SERBITHANG

DATE: JUNE 24, 2011

As endorsed during the 19th CCM held on 11th May 2011, the independent Principal Recipient Selection Committee (PRSC) was formed to evaluate the proposal on an endorsed criterion to **make fair and transparent selection of prospective principal recipient(s) for the Global Fund Round 11.**

Attendees:

PR Selection Committee:

1. Mr. Pema Tenzin, Member Secretary, Royal Society for Senior Citizens (NGO) (PR Selection Committee Chairperson).
2. Mr. Tshewang Norbu, Chief Program Officer, Dept. of Public Accounts, Ministry of Finance.
3. Ms. Sonam Tsoki Tenzin, Communication Officer, UNDP.

CCM Secretariat:

4. Mr. Karma, CCM Coordinator, CCM Secretariat.
5. Ms. Suneeta Chhetri, M & E Officer, CCM Secretariat.

Absentees:

1. Mr. Yeshi Pelzang, Planning Officer, GNHC. (member, PR Selection Committee)

Opening remark

The Chairperson of the committee expressed his sincere appreciation on behalf of Bhutan Country Coordinating Mechanism for making available to evaluate the proposal of the Principal Recipient for the Global Fund Round 11, besides, the chair also highlighted that the PRSC is to make fair and transparent selection of prospective principal recipient(s) for the Global Fund Round 11.

Further, he inform the committee, despite repeated advertisement in five widely reached news paper and broadcasting media, the CCM has received only one proposal from Ministry of Health.

Introduction to the Selection procedure

The CCM Coordinator expressed the great sense of regret for the committee member to intervene with their busy schedule, apart; the holistic contribution of the each committee member will be also part of the worlds initiative to fight against HIV/AIDS, TB and Malaria.

Taking an advantage, he rejuvenated on the roles of the committee and the PR selection procedures; accordingly, he then formally handed over the proposal of Ministry of Health to the Principal Selection Committee for the evaluation.

I. Signing of Conflict of Interest Policy

The committee members were also briefed on the conflict of interest of policy and so to mitigate the potential conflict of interest, members has signed the policy

II. Opening of the EOI form.

a. Stage one

Before opening the sealed proposal, every member has signed on envelop and then opened the sealed proposal.

The following documents were submitted

1. Duly filled EOI form
2. Financial management manual
3. M&E Plan for National AIDS Control Program (NACP)
4. M&E Plan for Vector borne Disease Control Program (VDCP)
5. M&E Plan for National TB Control Program (NTCP)
6. Procurement Manual
7. Audit reports:
 - a. VDCP (July 2009- June 2010),
 - b. NACP (Feb 2008-Jan 2009), (Feb 2009-Jan 2010);
 - c. NTCP (Jan 2008-December 2008) (Jan 2009- Dec 2009)

b. Stage two

The committee has cross check whether all the required documents were submitted and compliance and chairperson requested to sign on each pages of the dully filled Expression of Interest Form, accordingly, segregated the document.

III. The members evaluated the EOI, under the following CCM endorsed assessment criteria:

1. Governance structure :

It was noted that the MOH, as PR, is a well-established entity headed by the Minister of Health. All employees are civil servants and are guided by the Bhutan Civil Service Rules.

The Ministry has internal audit and is also audited annually by the independent Royal Audit Authority of Bhutan.

The Dept. of Medical Services, MOH oversees the diagnostic and curative services in the health sector. Its engagements surround health infrastructure, health facilities management, ambulances, drugs, equipments and traditional medicines.

The members found that the information provided was satisfactory.

2. Coordination, management & implementation of grant program (specifically, HIV/AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria)

Members noted that the ministry of health has been implementing the GFATM as the PR since 2005. It has implemented five grants successfully and also implementing HIV/AIDS round 6, Tuberculosis round 6 and Malaria round 7.

The Project management team has been dedicatedly implementing the GFATM grants. The grants so far availed are as follows:

Name of the disease	Signed amount (USD)	Amt disbursed (USD)
AIDS	2,942,870	1,978,119
TB	2,345,778	1,644,845
Malaria	4,296,122	3,513,191
Total grant	9,584,770	7,136,155

3. Management and grant making process

The ministry of health is equipped with policy and planning division, research ethical board, and ICT. It conducts various surveys and is well equipped to work on the proposal development. The ministry also has the health management and information system, which helps in the grant management process. In this light, it was noted that the MoH has the technical skills and knowledge required for acquiring grants.

4. Financial, procurement and supply management capacity including systems for fund disbursement.

The ministry adheres to the Royal Government of Bhutan financial management system. The drugs, vaccine and equipment division under the ministry is responsible for the procurement, supervision and distribution of all drugs and equipment.

Under the ministry, a depot of medical supplies in Phuentsholing manages the supply of medical items. The ministry of health has plans to expand the storage and design as per the international standard. The funding is budgeted in the coming financial year 2011-2012.

Along with the EOI the financial, procurement manuals were also submitted for reference.

5. Human and physical resources infrastructure.

The GFATM projects are directly carried out by PMT. Under it are three programs- National AIDS Control Program, National TB Control Program, Vector borne Disease Control Program, with adequate program personnel and finance personnel. The other departments under the ministry specialises in required technical areas and work in close collaboration with the three programs.

The implementing programs are sufficiently equipped with physical infrastructure. There are 29 hospitals, 176 basic health units and 485 outreach clinics in 20 districts. These hospitals and health units coordinate with each program's implementation works.

6. Program monitoring and evaluation and reporting.

The ministry has a strong M&E system in place in PPD. The Gross National Happiness Commission has institutionalised a *plams* tool into all ministries/organizations mainly to maintain a good M&E system. Also through Danish assistance, the ministry has developed a health management and information system equipped with trained users. It links the financial resources to programmatic performances.

There are periodic reporting and supervisory visits to the districts.

The PMT has developed a comprehensive reporting system for collecting data from SR-PR on quarterly basis. This system will be tested and piloted, and if successful, will be replicated for future grant implementations.

7. Knowledge and understanding of The Global Fund performance based funding process.

GF grants are granted on the quality of proposal- the country proposes a target to be approved by the Global Fund, thereby ensuring that the programs are appropriate to the national context and local realities.

The Global Fund's performance based funding approach is designed to:

- a. Provide incentives to encourage grant recipients to focus on the results rather than on inputs;
- b. Serve as a management tool for PR (PRs) of the grants to identify early opportunities to expand effective efforts and to address potential issues;
- c. Furnish the Global Fund with necessary performance information to decide on further disbursement of funds;
- d. Provide performance information to the CCM for its oversight and monitoring purposes; and
- e. Communicate periodic progress update to the Global Fund's Board and Wider constituency.

In line with the Global Fund's operating models, members felt that the MoH would be a qualified and well established/experienced body to avail the fund.

8. Adequate costing for program management.

The PR ensures cost effectiveness in the management of the programs. All the implementation will be decentralised to the SRs with proper guidelines to derive to the right costing in the program implementation.

9. Methodological approach to implementation of PR task.

The eligible PR implements programs in line with the approved work plan and budget and reports quarterly, as per the grant agreement signed. The SRs are disbursed funds, based on their fund disbursement request proposal as per their work plan and agreement signed and after implementation, the SRs are mandated to submit reports.

If Ministry of Health selected as the PR, the MOH will ensures that it will discharge all the six broad functions as designated by the Global Fund:

- a. Financial management
- b. Partnership coordination
- c. Technical coordination.
- d. Procurement management coordination.
- e. Monitoring and evaluation and reporting
- f. Grant implementation

The three programs will be strengthened with additional human resources to efficiently implement the program activities as per the approved work plan.

The M&E system developed will be used to effortlessly collect data.

IV. Comments from the PR Selection Committee :

1. As per the Global Fund requirement, the audit reports of three years for each disease must be submitted by the MoH to apply as PR for Global Fund grant.
2. The MoH must submit an application to the Dept of Revenue and Customs, Ministry of Finance for a tax exemption certificate.
3. PR Selection Committee's recommendation will be presented by the Ms. Sonam Tshoki Tenzin, Committee member, to the CCM for the endorsement of principal Recipient for the Global Fund round II

V. The total score sheet

Sl#	Assessment Criteria	Scores by the PR Selection Committee members				Total
		Mr. Pema Tenzin, Chair, CCM Alternate Member	Mr. Tshewang Norbu, Member, Ministry of Finance	Ms. Sonam Tsoki Tenzin, Member, Multilateral	Mr. Yeshi Pelzang, Member, GNHC	
1	Governance Structure	8	9	9	0	26
2	Coordination, management & implementation of grant program (specifically HIV/AIDS, Tuberculosis and Malaria)	7	9	8	0	24
3	Management of grant making process	5.5	7.5	7	0	20
4	Financial, Procurement and Supply management	8	9	7	0	24
5	Human and physical resources infrastructure	7	8	7	0	22
6	Program monitoring and evaluation	8	9	8	0	25
7	Knowledge and understanding of the Global Fund performance based funding process	9	9.5	9	0	27.5
8	Adequate costing for program management	7.5	8	8	0	23.5
9	Methodological approach to implementation of PR task	12	14	15	0	41
TOTAL SCORE		72	83	78	0	233
TOTAL PERCENTAGE						77.6%

Closing Remark

The chairperson of the committee informed the floor that the evaluation was successful and the report will be submitted to CCM for the endorsement.

Tashi Delek!

Annex 1

MINUTES OF THE EVALUATION OF THE PRINCIPAL RECIPIENT

VENUE: CHUNIDING RESORT, SERBITHANG

DATE: JUNE 24, 2011

Participant list

SI#	Name	Designation	Organisation /Department	Mobile #	E-mail
PR Selection Committee members					
1	Mr. Pema Tenzin (Vice Chairman)	Member Secretary	Royal Society for Senior Citizens	17604306	ptenzin@druknet.bt ; ptenzin.thimphu@yahoo.com
2	Ms. Sonam Tsoki Tenzin	Communication Officer	UNDP	17603474	tsoki@undp.org
3	Mr.Tshewang Norbu	Chief Program Officer	Dept. of Public Accounts, MoF	17516925	tnorbu@mof.gov.bt
CCM Secretariat					
1	Mr.Karma	CCM Coordinator	CCM Secretariat		ccmsecretariat.bht@gmail.com / karmatong@gmail.com
2	Ms.Suneeta Chhetri	M&E Officer	CCM secretariat	77200026	chhetri.suneeta@gmail.com

Annex 2

**EVALUATION AND SELECTION OF THE PRINCIPAL RECIPIENT
FOR THE GLOBAL FUND ROUND 11 (HIV/AIDS, TUBERCULOSIS AND MALARIA).
DATE: 24TH JUNE 2011
VENUE: CHUNNIDING RESORT, SERBITHANG**

AGENDA

Objectives:

- Evaluate and select the potential Principal Recipient for the Global Fund round 11

Time	Topic	Facilitator/Resource person
9:30 - 9:40 AM	Registration of Participants	Participants
9:40- 9:50 AM	Opening Remark	Chair- PR selection Committee
9:50 – 10:05	Functions of PR Selection committee/ overview of selection procedures	CCM Coordinator
10:05 - 10:15 AM	Signing of Conflict of Interest policy	Committee members
10:15	Tea Break	
10:15AM -01:00PM	Evaluation of the PR proposal	PR Selection Committee
1:00 PM	Lunch Break	
2:00 – 4:00PM	Evaluation of the PR proposal	PR Selection Committee
4:00PM	Tea Break	
4:00 – 5:00PM	Compilation of individual score sheet/Wrap up session	PR Selection Committee